

Research Paper: Peer Review of Rough Draft

The Instructor may have students use a sheet like the following, in order to help students focus their comments.

Author_____	Name of
Commentor_____	Name of

Research Paper: Draft Comments



TOPIC: Does the author clearly formulate the issue or question that the paper will try to address? Does the author clarify or define terms that would otherwise make the issue too vague? **(Worth 10 points on the final draft).**



CLARITY & ORGANIZATION: Is the paper clear and easy to read? Is the argument easy to follow? Are there sentences that are so unclear that you cannot tell what the author is trying to say? Are there spelling and grammar errors? **(Worth 20 points on the final draft).**



SOURCES: Are the author's arguments supported by sources? Does the author appropriately cite a source when offering evidence? Are the sources *good* sources according to the criteria that we have discussed? **(Worth 20 points on final draft).**



ARGUMENT: Does the author make a fairly good argument? Does the author support her/his view with plausible premises? Does the author avoid committing any fallacies or serious reasoning errors? **(Worth 20 points on the final draft).**



OBJECTION/COUNTER-ARGUMENT: Does the author consider a serious objection to his/her view? Does the author effectively use one of the strategies we've discussed for raising an objection to an argument? Does the author abide by the Principle of Rational Discussion in presenting an objection to her/his own view? **(Worth 20 points on final draft).**



RESPONSE: Does the author attempt to respond to the objections against her/his view in a way that takes the objections seriously? Does the author respond to the counter-argument by showing how the reasoning in the counter-argument is flawed? Does the author avoid committing fallacies in responding to the argument? **(Worth 10 points on final draft).**